Community Development Committee  
Meeting of December 7, 2020

For the Metropolitan Council meeting of December 23, 2020

**Subject:** City of Pine Springs 2040 Comprehensive Plan, Review File 22446-1

**Proposed Action**
That the Metropolitan Council adopt the attached Advisory Comments and Review Record and take the following actions:

1. Authorize the City of Pine Springs to place its 2040 Comprehensive Plan into effect.
2. Advise the City to:
   a. Provide the date that the Watershed District approves the Local Water Management Plan once it is formally approved.
   b. Prior to submission of its Final Plan to the Council, the City needs to include language in its Plan that allows for the protection of historic sites.
   c. Implement the advisory comments in the Review Record for Forecasts and Water Supply.

**Summary of Committee Discussion/Questions**
Senior Planner Jerome Benner II presented the staff’s report to the Committee. Council Member Cummings inquired about the decline in population and asked whether the City explained this in their Plan. Director Barajas responded by stating that the decline in population was most likely due to a natural cycle of household growth and change.

The Community Development Committee unanimously recommended approval of the proposed action at its meeting on December 7, 2020.
Community Development Committee
Meeting date: December 7, 2020

For the Metropolitan Council meeting of December 23, 2020

Subject: City of Pine Springs 2040 Comprehensive Plan, Review File 22446-1
District(s), Member(s): District 12, Francisco J. Gonzalez
Policy/Legal Reference: Metropolitan Land Planning Act (Minn. Stat. § 473.175)
Staff Prepared/Presented: Jerome Benner II, Senior Planner (651-602-1494)
                          Angela R. Torres, Local Planning Assistance Manager (651-602-1566)
Division/Department: Community Development / Regional Planning

Proposed Action
That the Metropolitan Council adopt the attached Advisory Comments and Review Record and take the following actions:

1. Authorize the City of Pine Springs to place its 2040 Comprehensive Plan into effect.
2. Advise the City to:
   a. Provide the date that the Watershed District approves the Local Water Management Plan once it is formally approved.
   b. Prior to submission of its Final Plan to the Council, the City needs to include language in its Plan that allows for the protection of historic sites.
   c. Implement the advisory comments in the Review Record for Forecasts and Water Supply.
Advisory Comments
The following Advisory Comments are part of the Council action authorizing the City of Pine Springs to implement its 2040 Comprehensive Plan (Plan).

Community Development Committee
1. As stated in the Local Planning Handbook, the City must take the following steps:
   a. Adopt the Plan in final form after considering the Council’s review recommendations as contained in the body of this report.
   b. Submit one hard copy and one electronic copy of the Plan to the Council. The electronic copy must be submitted as one unified file.
   c. Submit to the Council a copy of the City Council resolution evidencing final adoption of the Plan.

2. The Local Planning Handbook also states that local governments must formally adopt their comprehensive plans within nine months after the Council’s final action. If the Council has recommended changes to the Plan, local governments should incorporate those recommended changes into the Plan or respond to the Council before “final adoption” of the comprehensive plan by the governing body of the local governmental unit. (Minn. Stat. § 473.858, subd. 3)

3. Local governments must adopt official controls as identified in their 2040 comprehensive plans and must submit copies of the official controls to the Council within 30 days after the official controls are adopted. (Minn. Stat. § 473.865, subd. 1)

4. Local governmental units cannot adopt any official controls or fiscal devices that conflict with their comprehensive plans or which permit activities in conflict with the Council’s metropolitan system plans (Minn. Stat. §§ 473.864, subd. 2; 473.865, subd. 2). If official controls conflict with comprehensive plans, the official controls must be amended within 9 months following amendments to comprehensive plans (Minn. Stat. § 473.865, subd. 3).
Background
The City of Pine Springs is located in west-central Washington County. It is surrounded by the communities of Mahtomedi, Grant, Lake Elmo, and Oakdale.

The City submitted its 2040 Comprehensive Plan (Plan) to the Council for review to meet the Metropolitan Land Planning Act requirements (Minn. Stat. §§ 473.851 to 473.871) and the Council’s 2015 System Statement requirements.

Review Authority & Rationale
Minn. Stat. § 473.175 directs the Metropolitan Council to review a local government’s comprehensive plan and provide a written statement to the local government regarding the Plan’s:

- **Conformance** with metropolitan system plans
- **Consistency** with the adopted plans and policies of the Council
- **Compatibility** with the plans of adjacent governmental units and plans of affected special districts and school districts

By resolution, the Council may require a local government to modify its comprehensive plan if the Council determines that “the plan is more likely than not to have a substantial impact on or contain a substantial departure from metropolitan system plans” (Minn. Stat. § 473.175, subd. 1).

The attached Review Record details the Council’s assessment of the Plan’s conformance, consistency, and compatibility, and is summarized below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Review Standard</th>
<th>Review Area</th>
<th>Plan Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conformance</td>
<td>Regional system plan for Parks</td>
<td>Conforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conformance</td>
<td>Regional system plan for Transportation, including Aviation</td>
<td>Conforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conformance</td>
<td>Water Resources (Wastewater Services and Surface Water Management)</td>
<td>Conforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency with Council Policy</td>
<td><em>Thrive MSP 2040</em> and Land Use</td>
<td>Consistent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency with Council Policy</td>
<td>Forecasts</td>
<td>Consistent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency with Council Policy</td>
<td><em>2040 Housing Policy Plan</em></td>
<td>Consistent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency with Council Policy</td>
<td>Water Supply</td>
<td>Consistent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistency with Council Policy</td>
<td>Community and Subsurface Sewage Treatment Systems (SSTS)</td>
<td>Consistent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compatibility</td>
<td>Compatible with the plans of adjacent and affected governmental districts</td>
<td>Compatible</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Thrive Lens Analysis**
The proposed 2040 comprehensive plan is reviewed against the land use policies in *Thrive MSP 2040*. To achieve the outcomes identified in Thrive, the metropolitan development guide defines the Land Use Policy for the region and includes strategies for local governments and the Council to implement. These policies and strategies are interrelated and, taken together, serve to achieve the outcomes identified in Thrive.

**Funding**
The Metropolitan Council awarded the City a Planning Assistance Grant of $10,000 to complete its 2040 comprehensive plan. The first half of this grant was paid to initiate the local planning process. The second half of the grant will be paid after Council authorization of the City’s plan, local adoption, and the City’s submittal of final reporting requirements.
Known Support / Opposition
There is no known local opposition to the 2040 comprehensive plan.
**REVIEW RECORD**

City of Pine Springs 2040 Comprehensive Plan

Review File No. 22446-1, Business Item No. 2020-322

The following Review Record documents how the proposed Plan meets the requirements of the Metropolitan Land Planning Act and conforms to regional system plans, is consistent with regional policies, and is compatible with the plans of adjacent and affected jurisdictions.

**Conformance with Regional Systems**
The Council reviews plans to determine conformance with metropolitan system plans. The Council has reviewed the City’s Plan and finds that it conforms to the Council’s regional system plans for Regional Parks, Transportation (including Aviation), and Water Resources.

**Regional Parks and Trails**
Reviewer: Colin Kelly, Community Development (CD) - Regional Parks (651-602-1361)
The Plan conforms to the 2040 Regional Parks Policy Plan for the Regional Parks System element. Washington County would be the Park implementing agency for Regional Parks System components in the City of Pine Springs, however there are no Regional Parks System components in the City. There are also no state or federal recreation lands in the City.

**Regional Transportation, Transit, and Aviation**
Reviewer: Russ Owen, Metropolitan Transportation Services (MTS) (651-602-1724)

**Transportation**
The Plan conforms to the 2040 Transportation Policy Plan (TPP) adopted in 2015. It accurately reflects transportation system components of the TPP. The Plan is also consistent with Council policies regarding community roles, the needs of non-automobile transportation, access to job concentrations, and the needs of freight.

**Roadways**
The Plan conforms to the Roadways system element of the TPP. The Plan accurately describes the metropolitan highway system of principal arterials.

The Plan accurately reflects the regional functional classification map of A-minor arterials and has delineated major and minor collectors.

The Plan identifies all the required characteristics of the City’s roadways, including existing and future functional class, right-of-way preservation needs, and existing and forecasted traffic volumes for principal and A-minor arterials. Forecasting is consistent with regional methodology. The Plan also includes guidelines on how access will be managed for principal and A-minor arterials.

The Plan identifies roadway and corridor studies that include recommendations regarding alignments, changes in access, and/or changes in land use.

**Transit**
The Plan conforms to the Transit system element of the TPP. It shows the location of existing transit routes and facilities and acknowledges the City is within Transit Market Area IV.
The Plan is consistent with the policies of the Transit system element of the TPP. The Plan addresses community roles related to its Community Designation, as well as the opportunities and challenges related to its Transit Market Area.

**Aviation**
The Plan conforms to Aviation system element of the TPP. The Plan includes policies that protect regional airspace from obstructions.

**Bicycling and Walking**
The Plan is consistent with the Bicycle and Pedestrian chapter of the TPP. The Plan identifies existing and future segments of and connections to the Regional Bicycle Transportation Network (RBTN) and regional trails.

The Plan is also consistent with Bicycle and Pedestrian policies of the TPP by planning for local pedestrian and bicycle connections to transit, regional trails, regional job concentrations, and other regional destinations as identified on the RBTN map.

**Freight**
The Plan is consistent with Freight policies of the TPP. The Plan identifies the needs of freight movement in and through the community, including accessibility to freight terminals and facilities.

**Transportation Analysis Zones (TAZs)**
The Plan conforms to the TPP regarding TAZ allocations. The City’s TAZ allocations for employment, households, and population appropriately sum to the Metropolitan Council’s citywide forecast totals for all forecast years.

The City’s planned land uses and areas identified for development and redevelopment can accommodate the TAZ forecasted allocations in the Plan, and at densities consistent with the community’s Thrive designation.

**Water Resources**

**Wastewater Service**
_Reviewer: Kyle Colvin, Environmental Services (ES) – Engineering Programs (651-602-1151)_
The Plan conforms to the 2040 Water Resources Policy Plan (WRPP). The Plan represents the City’s guide for future growth and development through the year 2040. The City is entirely provided wastewater service through the use of individual private subsurface treatment systems (SSTS). The Plan indicates continued wastewater services will be provided through the use of SSTS’ through 2040. The Plan does not propose, nor anticipates, requesting connection to the Regional Wastewater Disposal system within the 20-year planning period; therefore, the City is not required to submit a Comprehensive Sewer Plan for approval.

The Metropolitan Council does not have plans to provide wastewater services to the community within the 2040 planning period.

**Surface Water Management**
_Reviewer: Judy Sventek, ES – Water Resources (651-602-1156)_
The Plan is consistent with Council policy requirements and in conformance with the Council’s WRPP for local surface water management. The Plan included the required elements for the Local Water Management Plan (LWMP). Council staff reviewed the LWMP elements of the Plan in September 2018.

The city lies entirely within the Valley Branch Watershed District (Watershed District). The city relies on the Watershed District for technical assistance and permitting. The City has also adopted the
Watershed District plan by reference. The Watershed District reviewed the updated LWMP and found it to be in compliance with their Watershed Management Plan.

Advisory Comments
The City needs to provide the Council with the date that the Watershed District approves the Local Water Management Plan once it is formally approved.

Consistency with Council Policies
The Council reviews plans to evaluate their apparent consistency with the adopted plans of the Council. Council staff have reviewed the City’s Plan and find that it is consistent with the Council’s policies, as detailed below.

Forecasts
Reviewer: Todd Graham, CD – Research (651-602-1322)
The Plan includes the System Statement forecast for the City (table 2.5). For reference, Metropolitan Council’s forecast is identified in Table 1 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. City of Pine Springs Forecasts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Census</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2010</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Households</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Metropolitan Council requires an analysis of how land supply will accommodate forecasted growth. Table 3-2 shown in the Plan, indicates a net addition of 6.3 acres of low density residential land. Council staff find this is sufficient to accommodate forecasted growth from 2019-2040.

Advisory Comments
The Plan states, “This [employment] number is incorrect. It may be that employment at O.H. Anderson Elementary School was misallocated to Pine Springs.” (Chapter 2, page 11). The Metropolitan Council’s source for annual employment is Minnesota DEED’s database, which shows recent employment reported by 11 distinct private sector employers, and not a public institution. Council staff expect most or all of this employment is in the southwest corner of the highway interchange (TAZ 2342). Council staff recommend against revising the employment forecast at this time.

The Transportation chapter includes Table 5.4 that allocates the forecast to transportation analysis zones (TAZ). However, the table uses an obsolete TAZ system map from 2001. In the final plan submission, Council staff recommend that Table 5.4 be replaced and the TAZ allocation should use the current, TAZ system. Old TAZ 1148 is split along Hilton Trail into two current TAZs: TAZ 2337 is the northeast quarter of Pine Springs, east of Hilton Trail; TAZ 2338 is everything west of Hilton Trail. Old TAZ 1125 is now current TAZ 2342. Old TAZ 1128 is now current TAZ 2349.

Thrive MSP 2040 and Land Use
Reviewer: Jerome Benner II, CD – Local Planning Assistance (651-602-1494)
The Plan is consistent with Thrive MSP 2040 and its land use policies. The Plan acknowledges the Thrive community designation of Rural Residential (Figure 2). Rural Residential communities have existing residential patterns characterized by large lots and do not have plans to provide urban infrastructure, such as centralized wastewater treatment. Many of these communities have topographical development limitations and a development pattern with lot sizes. Rural Residential communities are expected to discourage future development of rural residential patterns and where opportunities exist, plan for rural development at densities that are not greater than 1 unit per 10 acres.
The existing land uses in Pine Springs are predominately residential (40%), followed by Right of Way (26%) resulting from the I-694 / Highway 36 interchange that is located in the southwest portion of the City. Open Water and Wetlands make up about 21% of the land area. There is about 9% of land designated as Open Space that abuts existing residential subdivisions.

This community is fully developed with approximately 2% of undeveloped land and has limited land supply for any potential new growth due to the regional investment in the TH 36 and I-694 interchange in the southwest portion of the City (Figure 3). The existing land use patterns reflect the City’s commitment to preserving natural landscapes and investing in the development of single-family detached housing. The majority of residential development is located in the northern portion of the City, with some additional housing in the southern portion along both sides of TH 36, and near the interchange.

The Plan is consistent with Thrive for land use and residential density policies for a Rural Residential community designation because it guides Rural Residential land at a maximum density of 1 unit per 2.5 acres across 241 acres. The land use chapter mentions that the City will consider the Council’s Flexible Development Guidelines for any redeveloped land as a strategy for resource protection.

The City has identified a few areas of future residential growth. There are three locations identified as vacant on Figure 3 of this report which the Plan identifies as potentially being developed as single family residential uses. There is also a small area that is currently guided residential in the southwest corner of the City, immediately south of the I-694 / TH 36 interchange that is being planned for Mixed Use – Industrial uses (Figure 4).

**Housing**

Reviewer: Hilary Lovelace, CD – Housing (651-602-1555)

The Plan is consistent with the 2040 Housing Policy Plan. As of 2016, the City has 150 homes all of which are single-family homes. Approximately two homes are rented. Eight housing units are currently affordable to households earning under 80% of Area Median Income (AMI), however, more than 10 households earning 80% of AMI or below are paying more than 30% of their income toward housing costs.

The Plan identifies existing housing needs including allowing seniors to age in place or community, and housing opportunities for families with children. The City does not currently have any publicly subsidized housing. The City does not have an allocation of affordable housing need in the 2021-2030 decade, as it is not expected to experience any sewer-serviced growth.

The housing implementation plan component of the Plan describes that the City will continue partnership with Washington County CDA to meet many of their housing needs and refer residents to programs offered by the county including homeowner counseling in foreclosure and the septic system loan program. The Plan also indicates that the City will provide information about programs available to seniors to modify their homes to age in place, and refer residents to services provided by the Two Rivers Community Land Trust.

**Water Supply**

Reviewer: Lanya Ross, ES – Water Supply Planning (651-602-1803)

The Plan is consistent with WRPP policies related to water supply, including the policy on sustainable water supplies, the policy on assessing and protecting regional water resources, and the policy on water conservation and reuse.

Because the City relies primarily on private wells and does not own/operate a municipal community public water supply system, no Local Water Supply Plan is required as part of the Plan. However, the
Plan should, and does, include information about water sources, including plans to protect private water supplies, in appropriate sections of the local comprehensive plan.

**Advisory Comments**
The Plan acknowledges the vulnerability of the local aquifers and commits to actions to support private well owners testing and working with Washington County, Minnesota Department of Health (MDH), and others to protect groundwater quality. However, the Plan would be improved by acknowledging that the Drinking Water Supply Management Areas for Mahtomedi and North St. Paul both overlap the City of Pine Springs. This information is illustrated in Figure 5 of the Pine Springs 2015 System Statement, and the GIS data is available online in the MDH Source Water Protection Web Map Viewer and on the MN Geospatial Commons. Groundwater protection efforts in Pine Springs provide additional benefit to those neighboring communities, and there may be opportunities to collaborate on groundwater protection education.

**Community and Subsurface Sewage Treatment Systems (SSTS)**
*Reviewer: Kyle Colvin, ES – Engineering Programs (651-602-1151)*
The Plan indicates that all of the 143 residences located in the City are served by individual SSTS. There are no identified public or privately-owned Community Wastewater Treatment Systems operating in the City. The Washington County SSTS Ordinance is codified in the Development Code as Chapter 4, Ordinance 206, which includes meeting the standards of Minnesota Pollution Control Agency (MPCA) Chapter 7080-7083 Rules. Washington County is responsible for implementing the ordinance in the City, including requirements for compliance inspections of existing systems, permitting and inspection of new and replacement systems, site review, maintenance requirements, and operating permits for Type IV Advanced Sewage Treatment Systems. The City’s program is consistent with MPCA Rules and Council WRPP requirements.

**Special Resource Protection**

**Solar Access Protection**
*Reviewer: Cameran Bailey, CD – Local Planning Assistance (651-602-1212)*
The Plan is consistent with statutory requirements (Minn. Stat. § 473.859) and Council policy regarding planning for the protection and development of access to direct sunlight for solar energy systems as required by the Metropolitan Land Planning Act (MLPA). The Plan includes the required solar planning elements.

**Aggregate Resource Protection**
*Reviewer: Cameran Bailey, CD – Local Planning Assistance (651-602-1212)*
The Plan is consistent with the Council’s aggregate resources inventory included in Minnesota Geological Survey Information Circular 46, that there are no known deposits of viable aggregate resources available for mining within the community.

**Historic Preservation**
*Reviewer: Jerome Benner II, CD – Local Planning Assistance (651-602-1494)*
To comply with the Metropolitan Land Planning Act, the Plan must include a protection element for historic sites. In Chapter 3, Land Use, the Plan states that there are no buildings or features eligible for historic preservation status. However, the City needs to consider future identification of historic sites. The Plan could add a statement like: “If historic resources are identified within the community, the City commits to the creation of policies to protect and conserve historic and cultural resources.”

**Advisory Comments**
Prior to submission of its Final Plan to the Council, the City needs to include language in its Plan that allows for the protection of historic sites.
**Plan Implementation**

*Reviewer: Jerome Benner II, CD – Local Planning Assistance (651-602-1494)*

The Plan includes a description of the zoning, subdivision, SSTS codes, and the housing implementation program. The Plan fulfills requirements for a capital improvement program and describes official controls and fiscal devices that the City will employ to implement the Plan.

**Compatibility with Plans of Adjacent Governmental Units and Plans of Affected Special Districts and School Districts**

The proposed Plan is compatible with the plans of adjacent jurisdictions. No compatibility issues with plans of adjacent governmental units and plans of affected special districts and school districts were identified.

**Documents Submitted for Review**

In response to the 2015 System Statement, the City submitted the following documents for review:

- April 14, 2020: Pine Springs 2040 Comprehensive Plan
- May 26, 2020: City Resolution and Comprehensive Plan Submittal Form
- October 9, 2020: Revisted Implementation and Land Use Chapters

**Attachments**

- Figure 1: Location Map with Regional Systems
- Figure 2: *Thrive MSP 2040* Community Designations
- Figure 3: Existing Land Use
- Figure 4: 2040 Planned Land Use
Figure 2. Thrive MSP 2040 Community Designations
Figure 3. Existing Land Use
Figure 4. 2040 Planned Land Use